**Al-Farabi Kazakh National University**

**Faculty biology and biotechnology**

**Department of biophysics, biomedicine and neuroscience**

**APPROVED by**

**Dean of Faculty**

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ **Zayadan K.B.**

**№1 "12" September 2023**

**EDUCATIONAL-METHODICAL COMPLEX OF DISCIPLINE**

**CODE**

**«MUUP5303»**

**«Methodology and management of the training process»**

Specialty «7M01504»

Course – 1

Semester –2

Number of credits – 6

Lecture – 3, 6

Seminar – 2, 4

IWSP – 6

**Almaty 2024**

Educational-methodical complex of the discipline is elaborated by Tormanova A.N senior lecture of the Department Biophysics, biomedicine and neurosciences, Doctor of philosophy (PhD)

Considered and recommended at the meeting of the Department Biophysics, biomedicine and neurosciences from August «28» 2023 year, protocol №1

Head of department \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Kustubayeva A.M.

**SYLLABUS**

**Sprimg semester 2023-2024 academic year**

**Educational program "Methodology and management of the training process»**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **ID**  **and name**  **of course** | **Independent work**  **of the student**  **(IWS)** | | **Number of credits** | | | **General**  **number**  **of credits** | **Independent work**  **of the student**  **under the guidance**  **of a teacher (IWST)** |
| **Lectures (L)** | **Practical classes (PC)** | **Lab. classes (LC)** |
| #101649  Methodology and management of the training process | 3 | | 3,0 | 3,0 |  | 6 | 6 |
| **ACADEMIC INFORMATION ABOUT THE COURSE** | | | | | | | |
| **Learning Format** | **Cycle,**  **component** | **Lecture**  **types** | | **Types**  **of practical classes** | | **Form and platform final control** | |
| Offline/Combined | Professional Theoretical | Logical, analytical review | | Solution of situational and problem assignments, analytical review, project assignments, logical assignments disputes | | Verbal exam | |
| **Lecturer - (s)** | Tormanova Anel Nurtayevna | | | | |
| **e-mail :** | Anel.Tormanova@gmail.com | | | | |
| **Phone :** | 7701387 4016 | | | | |
| **Assistant - (s)** | Ashirova Zhadyra Berdimuratovna | | | | |
| **e-mail :** | Ashirova.Zhadyra@kaznu.kz | | | | |
| **Phone :** | 8771467 0970 | | | | |
| **ACADEMIC COURSE PRESENTATION** | | | | | | | |
| **Purpose**  **of the course:** | **Expected Learning Outcomes (LO) \*** | | | | | **Indicators of LO achievement (ID)** | |
| To form managerial skills with application of management methodology and state obligatory standards in the organization and management and preparation of the educational and training process | 1. To comply with the requirements of the state obligatory standard in the process of implementation of the educational process | | | | | * 1. Determine the basic required course volume for subjects | |
| * 1. Select and apply criteria for evaluation and testing of knowledge in the organization and implementation of the teaching and learning process | |
| 2. Apply the State Common Core Standards/GCSS for the purposes of strategic and tactical planning of the teaching and learning process | | | | | * 1. Identify key strategic objectives to inform the current annual plan for training process | |
| * 1. Evaluate and adapt current tactical objectives of thematic lessons in accordance with the strategic goals outlined in the standard | |
| 3. Develop training programs in accordance with the requirements of the standard and the development of methods for managing the educational process | | | | | * 1. Identify links with the main thematic sections, taking into account subject and cross-curricular links. | |
| * 1. Определять степень нагрузки и длительность усвоения тематических разделов по предметам в зависимости от возраста и уровня подготовленности учащихся в ходе составления учебной программы | |
| 4. To propose ways to improve the methodology of learning process management | | | | | * 1. Evaluate practical tools to practically improve the effectiveness of instructional management | |
| * 1. Determine what visual, technical tools and techniques are needed to support the learning process | |
| 5. Apply business approaches to managing the learning process: analysis, goal setting, planning, decision making, organization and control, motivation and delegation, marketing | | | | | * 1. Practical application of business principles in the organization of the educational process | |
| * 1. Planning objectives and achievable results for each level of management | |
| **Prerequisites** | **Pedagogics, Psychology** | | | | | | |
| **Postrequisites** | Pedagogy, Psychology, Theoretical Biology, Methods of Teaching Biology | | | | | | |
| Learning Resources | Literature: main, additional.   1. «Об утверждении государственных общеобязательных стандартов образования для всех уровней образования» Приказ Мин-ва образования и науки РК от 31.10.2018. № 604 2. Об Образовании – Закон РК от 27.07.2017 года № 319-III 3. Приложение №7 к Постановлению Правительства РК от 13.05. 2016 года №292 4. Базавлуцкая Л.М. Педагогический менеджмент: учебное пособие / Челябинск: Изд-во ЗАО «Библиотека А. Миллера», 2017. - 97 с 5. Гончаров М.А. Основы менеджмента в образовании. учебное пособие / — 3-е изд., стер. — М. : КНОРУС, 2016. — 476 с 6. Садвакасова З.М.   Педагогический менеджмент. Учебное пособие. 2‐2е изд.доп. ‐ Алматы, 2012. ‐ 187 с. 7. Рыблова А.Н. Технология управления образовательным процессом в системе непрерывного образования. Учебно-методическое пособие – Саратов: Издательский центр «Наука», 2009. – 96 с 8. Академическая политика КазНУ им. аль-Фараби – текущий вариант   **Professional scientific databases**   1. <https://cyberleninka.ru/>   Internet resources   1. <http://elibrary.kaznu.kz/ru> 2. <http://lib.teacher.msu.ru/pub/2017> 3. <https://students-library.com/library/read/60508-metody-priemy-sredstva-organizacii-i-upravlenia-pedagogiceskim-processom> 4. <http://usu.kz/upravlenie_uchebnym_protsessom.php> 5. <http://student39.ru/lector/Metody-_priemy_i_formy_obucheniya/> | | | | | | |
|  |  | | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Academic**  **course policy** | | The academic policy of the course is determined by [the Academic Policy](https://univer.kaznu.kz/Content/instructions/%D0%90%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B4%D0%B5%D0%BC%D0%B8%D1%87%D0%B5%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%B0%D1%8F%20%D0%BF%D0%BE%D0%BB%D0%B8%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%BA%D0%B0.pdf) and [the Policy of Academic Integrity of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University .](https://univer.kaznu.kz/Content/instructions/%D0%9F%D0%BE%D0%BB%D0%B8%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%BA%D0%B0%20%D0%B0%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B4%D0%B5%D0%BC%D0%B8%D1%87%D0%B5%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%BE%D0%B9%20%D1%87%D0%B5%D1%81%D1%82%D0%BD%D0%BE%D1%81%D1%82%D0%B8.pdf)  Documents are available on the main page of IS Univer .  **Integration of science and education.** The research work of students, undergraduates and doctoral students is a deepening of the educational process. It is organized directly at the departments, laboratories, scientific and design departments of the university, in student scientific and technical associations. Independent work of students at all levels of education is aimed at developing research skills and competencies based on obtaining new knowledge using modern research and information technologies. A research university teacher integrates the results of scientific activities into the topics of lectures and seminars (practical) classes, laboratory classes and into the tasks of the IWST, IWS, which are reflected in the syllabus and are responsible for the relevance of the topics of training sessions andassignments.  **Attendance.** The deadline for each task is indicated in the calendar (schedule) for the implementation of the content of the course. Failure to meet deadlines results in loss of points.  **Аcademic honesty.** Practical/laboratory classes, IWS develop the student's independence, critical thinking, and creativity. Plagiarism, forgery, the use of cheat sheets, cheating at all stages of completing tasks are unacceptable.  Compliance with academic honesty during the period of theoretical training and at exams, in addition to the main policies, is regulated by [the "Rules for the final control"](https://univer.kaznu.kz/Content/instructions/%D0%9F%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%B8%D0%BB%D0%B0%20%D0%BF%D1%80%D0%BE%D0%B2%D0%B5%D0%B4%D0%B5%D0%BD%D0%B8%D1%8F%20%D0%B8%D1%82%D0%BE%D0%B3%D0%BE%D0%B2%D0%BE%D0%B3%D0%BE%20%D0%BA%D0%BE%D0%BD%D1%82%D1%80%D0%BE%D0%BB%D1%8F%20%D0%9B%D0%AD%D0%A1%202022-2023%20%D1%83%D1%87%D0%B3%D0%BE%D0%B4%20%D1%80%D1%83%D1%81%D1%8F%D0%B7%D1%8B%D0%BA%D0%B5.pdf) , ["Instructions for the final control of the autumn / spring semester of the current academic year"](https://univer.kaznu.kz/Content/instructions/%D0%98%D0%BD%D1%81%D1%82%D1%80%D1%83%D0%BA%D1%86%D0%B8%D1%8F%20%D0%B4%D0%BB%D1%8F%20%D0%B8%D1%82%D0%BE%D0%B3%D0%BE%D0%B2%D0%BE%D0%B3%D0%BE%20%D0%BA%D0%BE%D0%BD%D1%82%D1%80%D0%BE%D0%BB%D1%8F%20%D0%B2%D0%B5%D1%81%D0%B5%D0%BD%D0%BD%D0%B5%D0%B3%D0%BE%20%D1%81%D0%B5%D0%BC%D0%B5%D1%81%D1%82%D1%80%D0%B0%202022-2023.pdf) , "Regulations on checking students' text documents for borrowings".  Documents are available on the main page of IS Univer .  **Basic principles of inclusive education.** The educational environment of the university is conceived as a safe place where there is always support and equal attitude from the teacher to all students and students to each other, regardless of gender, race / ethnicity, religious beliefs, socio-economic status, physical health of the student, etc. All people need the support and friendship of peers and fellow students. For all students, progress is more about what they can do than what they can't. Diversity enhances all aspects of life.  All students, especially those with disabilities, can receive counseling assistance by phone / e- mail [Anel.Tormanova@gmail.com](mailto:Anel.Tormanova@gmail.com); or via video link in MS Teams[*http://surl.li/ovmlq*](http://surl.li/ovmlq)  **Integration MOOC (massive open online course).** In the case of integrating MOOC into the course, all students need to register for MOOC. The deadlines for passing MOOC modules must be strictly observed in accordance with the course study schedule.  **ATTENTION!** The deadline for each task is indicated in the calendar (schedule) for the implementation of the content of the course, as well as in the MOOC. Failure to meet deadlines results in loss of points. | | | | |
| **INFORMATION ABOUT TEACHING, LEARNING AND ASSESSMENT** | | | | | | |
| **Score-rating letter system of assessment of accounting for educational achievements** | | | | | **Assessment Methods** | |
| **Grade** | **Digital**  **equivalent**  **points** | | **points,**  **% content** | **Assessment according to the traditional system** | **Criteria-based assessment** is the process of correlating actual learning outcomes with expected learning outcomes based on clearly defined criteria. Based on formative and summative assessment.  **Formative assessment is** a type of assessment that is carried out in the course of daily learning activities. It is the current measure of progress. Provides an operational relationship between the student and the teacher. It allows you to determine the capabilities of the student, identify difficulties, help achieve the best results, timely correct the educational process for the teacher. The performance of tasks, the activity of work in the classroom during lectures, seminars, practical exercises (discussions, quizzes, debates, round tables, laboratory work, etc.) are evaluated. Acquired knowledge and competencies are assessed.  **Summative assessment** -type of assessment, which is carried out upon completion of the study of the section in accordance with the program of the course.Conducted 3-4 times per semester when performing IWS. This is the assessment of mastering the expected learning outcomes in relation to the descriptors. Allows you to determine and fix the level of mastering the course for a certain period. Learning outcomes are evaluated. | |
| A | 4.0 \_ | | 95-100 | Great |
| A- | 3.67 | | 90-94 |
| B+ | 3.33 | | 85-89 | Fine |
| B | 3.0 | | 80-84 | **Formative and summative assessment** | **Points % content** |
| B- | 2.67 | | 75-79 | Activity at lectures | 0 |
| C+ | 2.33 | | 70-74 | Work in practical classes | 7\*6=42 |
| C | 2.0 | | 65-69 | Satisfactorily | Independent work | 20+30=50 |
| C- | 1.67 | | 60-64 | Design and creative activity | 8 |
| D+ | 1.33 | | 55-59 | Final control (exam) | 40 |
| D | 1.0 | | 50-54 | TOTAL | 100 |
| FX | 0,5 | | 25-49 | Unsatisfactory |
| F | 0 | | 0-24 |
| **Calendar (schedule) for the implementation of the content of the course. Methods of teaching and learning.** | | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **A week** | **Topic name** | **Number of hours** | **Max.**  **ball** |
| **MODULE 1 Background and general provisions in the management of the training process** | | | |
| **1** | **L 1.Introduction. Pedagogical management - business processes and communications. Education and upbringing - the main goals of the methodology of educational process management. Criteria and principles of selection of the content of the educational process - as part of the development of management methodology** | **1** |  |
| **PC 1.** Principles of humanization, integration and formation of creative personality as a component of the content of general education - general cultural values and competences.  The concept of the function "management". The main stakeholders of the process. The principle of building a risk map and models of an ideal learning process. | **2** | **6** |
| **2** | **L 2. State Common Core Learning Standards. Detailed analysis and comments. Technology of management of the general education process.** | **1** |  |
| **PC 2.** General Provisions of the GOS in order to organize the educational process. Structural and functional components for process management. Objectives of the Management. | **2** | **6** |
| **3** | **L 3** **Modular system of educational process organization: goals and objectives. Prospects and achievements. Pedagogical analysis** | **1** |  |
| **PC 3.** Experience of application of the modular system of educational process organization. Goal setting and mission. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWS P 1.** Consultation on ISW implementation of the topic: "Modern requirements for the choice of methods of teaching biology" - Make the main conclusions on the passed material of module 1. To express a view on the current state of biology teaching processes: advantages and disadvantages based on facts and examples from their personal experience | **1** | **4** |
| **4** | **L 4. Pedagogical technologies and collaborative ways of learning. Planning** | **1** |  |
| **PC 4.** Information content and how to manage information as part of the learning process. Components of planning. Basic rules of planning. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWS 1. "Modern requirements for the selection of methods of teaching biology" -.**  **1) A written essay of at least 1.5 pages in WORD format, 1.0 spacing, Times New Roman #12 font,**  **2) with the obligatory indication of the sources of information worked out**  **3) Anti-plagiarism check of at least 55-60%** |  | **20** |
| **5** | **L 5. Motivation for self-discovery as part of the learning process. Intensive methods and means of guidance and control. Decision making** | **1** |  |
| **PC 5.** Processes of decision preparation. Principles in developing solutions. "Kaleidoscope" thinking, role-playing and internships, and real-life experiences | **2** | **6** |
| **IWST 2.** Colloquium - discussion on the topic:  "Historical background to the creation of standards on the methodology of educational process management". | 1 | **4** |
| **MODULE 2 Components of learning management** | | | |
| **6** | **L 6. Expected learning outcomes as part of the management of the learning process on the example of the discipline "Biology". Organization of training** | **1** |  |
| **PC 6.** Actual methods and ways of teaching in the subject "Biology" mandatory to achieve the expected results. What is necessary for the organization of innovative learning? What core competencies should an organization possess for successful implementation of the learning process. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWST 3.** Consultations on the implementation of **IWS 2** |  |  |
| **7** | **L 7. Delegation of authority - basic principles. Model of "three-step" algorithm of task delegation.** | **1** |  |
| **PC 7.** Is the ability to set, control the execution of tasks an acquired skill or a natural talent? Punishment and Stimulation are equal tools of effective management. Evaluation of manager's performance, feedback is the key to finding problematic issues. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWS 2. Business approach requirements for training process organization. Original essay with conclusions and list of references no less than 3 pages. Anti-plagiarism check of at least 55-60%** |  | **30** |
| **Midterm control 1** | | | **100** |
| **8** | **L 8. Requirements for the organization and management of the training process. Motivation of personnel as a participant of the learning process. Motivation concepts as a management tool.** | **1** |  |
| **PC 8.** Reasonableness of application - motivation as a stimulation of quality labor. Material and non-material motivation of labor: positive and negative examples of motivation and demotivation of personnel. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWST 4.** Consultations and feedback on results **IWS 2** |  |  |
| **9** | **L 9. Target benchmarks and models of professional competencies - methodological basis for managing the educational process. Compliance requirements, corporate ethics and reputation of the educational institution. Discipline fulfillment of training process.** | **1** |  |
| **PC 9.** What methods are used to meet the benchmarks and form professional competencies? Human values, teacher's values, learner's values - a field for joint growth and interaction. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWST 5.** Consultations on the implementation of **IWS 3** |  |  |
| **10** | **L 10. General issues of the organization of the educational process in relation to the current situation. Experience and mistakes. Pedagogical control.** | **1** |  |
| **PC 10.** Curriculum as a joint program of actions of the teacher and students. Knowledge control systems, knowledge assessment system. The main functions of control, means of communication, verification of information and facts.. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWST 4.** Colloquium - answers to questions on the fulfillment of tasks of the 2nd module |  |  |
| **MODULE 3 Scope of application of business principles in educational process management** | | | |
| **11** | **L 11. Practical applicability of the methodology of educational process management in organizations of different directions** | **1** |  |
| **PC 11.** Definitions, terminology, and normative references - to meet educational state standards. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWS 3.** Pedagogical analysis and corrective decision-making - as part of the process of learning control. Project work on the analysis of a specific case, designed in the form of a report for performance - presentation of at least 7 slides |  | **50** |
| **12** | **L12. Pedagogical monitoring - functionality. Types, system, technology** | **1** |  |
| **PC 12.** Direction of pedagogical monitoring, personal development of the student, teacher, management activity, learning activity. Work with underachievers, laggards. | **2** | **6** |
| **IWST 5.** Consultations and feedback on results **IWST 3** |  | **2** |
| **13** | **L 13. Principles of business approach in educational process management: analysis, goal-setting, planning, decision-making, organization and control, motivation and delegation, marketing** | **1** |  |
| **PC 13.** What visual, demonstration and technical methods - contribute to the realization of the learning process in the subject "Biology" | **2** | **6** |
| **IWST 6.** Consultation on exam preparation |  | **2** |
| **14** | **L 14. Innovative approaches applicable to the learning management process.** | **1** |  |
| **PC 14.** Innovative approaches applicable to improve the organization of the learning process - models of the future. Pedagogical analysis and quality control | **2** | **6** |
| **15** | **L 15. Diversity and flexibility of formats, training models - as a basis for the development of learning process management methodology. Pedagogical marketing. Tasks of marketing in the educational process. Marketing tools.** | **1** |  |
| **PC 15.** Best practices and models for managing the educational process. List marketing strategies for the educational process, tools for researching consumer needs and demands, analyzing the target audience. | **2** | **6** |
| **Midterm control 2** | | | **100** |
| **Final control (exam)** | | | **100** |
| **TOTAL for course** | | | **100** |

**Lecturer \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**Tormanova A.N.

**RUBRICATOR OF THE SUMMATIVE ASSESSMENT**

**CRITERIA EVALUATION OF LEARNING OUTCOMES**

Issued at the request of the teacher for each planned summative assessment (IWST)

**TEMPLATE**

**Task name** (points, % content from 100% MC, copy from the calendar (graphics) implementation of the content of the training course, methods of teaching and learning

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **"Excellent"**  **Max. weight in %** | **"Good"**  **Max. weight in %** | **"Satisfactory"**  **Max. weight in %** | **"Unsatisfactory"**  **Max. weight in %** |
|  |  |  |  |  |

**Example 1. Written assignment "My professional history" (25% of 100% MC)**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **"Excellent"**  20-25% | **"Good"**  15-20% | **"Satisfactory"**  10-15% | **"Unsatisfactory"**  0-10% |
| **Understanding Theories**  **and concepts of professional identity and professionalism of a teacher** | Deep understanding of theories, concepts of professional identity and teacher professionalism. Relevant and relevant links (citations) to key sources are provided. | Understanding theories, concepts of professional identity and teacher professionalism. Links (citations) to key sources are provided. | Limited understanding of theories, concepts of professional identity and teacher professionalism. Limited references (citations) to key sources are provided. | Superficial understanding / lack of understanding of theories, concepts of professional identity and professionalism of the teacher.  Relevant references (citations) to key sources are not provided. |
| **Awareness of key issues of professional identity and professionalism of teachers in Kazakhstan** | Links well the key concepts of professional identity and teacher professionalism with the context of Kazakhstan. Excellent substantiation of arguments with evidence from empirical research (for example, based on interviews or statistical analysis). | Links the concepts of professional identity and teacher professionalism with the context of Kazakhstan. Supports arguments with evidence from empirical research. | Limited connection of the concepts of professional identity and professionalism of teachers with the context of Kazakhstan. Limited use of evidence from empirical research. | There is little or no connection between the concepts of a teacher's professional identity and the context of Kazakhstan. Little or no use of empirical research. |
| **Policy proposal or practical recommendations/suggestions** | Offers sound policy and/or practical recommendations, proposals for improving the professional identity and professionalism of teachers in Kazakhstan. | Offers some policy and/or practical recommendations, proposals for enhancing the professional identity and professionalism of teachers in Kazakhstan | Limited policy and practical recommendations. Recommendations are non-essential, not based on rigorous analysis, and are shallow. | Little or no policy and practice advice, or advice of very low quality. |
| **Letter,**  **APA style** | The writing demonstrates clarity, conciseness and correctness. Strictly follows the APA style. | The letter demonstrates clarity, conciseness and correctness. Basically follows the APA style. | The letter has some key errors and clarity needs to be improved. There are mistakes in following the APA style. | The writing is unclear, it is difficult to follow the content. Lots of mistakes in following the APA style. |

**Example 2. Group presentation "Teaching profession in Kazakhstan" (30% of 100% RK)**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **"Excellent"**  25-30% | **"Good"**  20-20% | **"Satisfactory"**  15-20% | **"Unsatisfactory"**  0 – 15% |
| **Understanding theories and concepts of the professional identity of the teacher and the teaching profession** | Deep understanding of theories, concepts of the professional identity of the teacher and the teaching profession. | Understanding theories, concepts of the professional identity of the teacher and the teaching profession. | Limited understanding of theories, concepts of the professional identity of the teacher and the teaching profession. | Superficial understanding / lack of understanding of theories, concepts of the professional identity of the teacher and the teaching profession. |
| **Awareness of key issues of the professional identity of the teacher and the teaching profession in Kazakhstan** | Competent correlation of the key concepts of the professional identity of the teacher and the teaching profession with the context of Kazakhstan. Excellent substantiation of arguments with evidence from empirical research (for example, based on interviews or statistical analysis). | There is a connection between the concepts of professional identity of a teacher and the teaching profession with the context of Kazakhstan. The arguments are backed by evidence from empirical research. | Limited correlation of the professional identity of the teacher and the concepts of the teaching profession with the context of Kazakhstan. Limited use of evidence from empirical research | Insignificant connection / lack of connection between the concepts of the teacher's professional identity and the context of Kazakhstan. Little or no empirical research is used. |
| **Pilot Study** | Excellent use of the results of pilot studies (interviews or surveys) in the presentation | Good use of the results of pilot studies (interviews or surveys) in the presentation. | Satisfactory use of the results of pilot studies (interviews or surveys) in the presentation. | Poor use of the results of pilot studies (interviews or surveys) in the presentation. |
| **Suggestion of policy or practical recommendations/suggestions** | Offers very good policy and/or practical advice or suggestions for improving the professional identity and teaching profession in Kazakhstan. | Offers some policy and/or practical recommendations or suggestions for improving the professional identity and teaching profession in Kazakhstan. | Limited policy and practical recommendations. Recommendations are non-essential, not based on rigorous analysis, and are shallow. | Little or no policy and practice advice, or advice of very low quality. |
| **Presentation,**  **teamwork** | Excellent, attractive presentation, excellent quality of visuals, slides, materials, excellent teamwork. | Good engagement, good quality visuals, slides or other materials, good teamwork. | Satisfactory level of involvement, satisfactory quality of materials, satisfactory level of teamwork. | Low engagement, low quality content, poor teamwork. |